Transactions of the American Philological Association 113 (1983) 171–182

CHARACTER AND LEGEND IN *IDYLL* 8

KATHRYN GUTZWILLER
University of Cincinnati

Nineteenth- and early twentieth-century scholars who were attempting to disprove the Theocritean authorship of *Idyll* 8 lodged a number of charges against it. One of the most serious of these was inconsistency in characterization.[1] The age of Daphnis and Menalcas, who are apparently in early adolescence at the time of their contest, was thought to comport badly with the erotic nature of their songs. It was further argued that the singers display sexual maturity in their elegiac songs but youthful modesty in the hexameter ones. Although the question of authorship has now been generally settled in favor of spuriousness,[2] the charge of inconsistency of characterization has never been satisfactorily dealt with.

The standard answer is that the songs are just songs and not meant to reflect the lives of their singers.[3] This leaves us with a poem totally

[1] Gottfried Hermann, *Opuscula* 5 (Leipzig 1834; reprinted Hildesheim 1970) 87; Carl Brinker, *De Theocriti vita carminibusque subditiciis* (Diss. Rostock 1884) 29–30; Carl Kattein, *Theocriti idylliis octavo et nono cur abroganda sit fides Theocritea* (Paris 1901) 48. The argument was used to support the theory that the poem was a pastiche, consisting of sections written by more than one author.

[2] A. S. F. Gow, ed., *Theocritus* (Cambridge 1952²) II 170–71, points out that the evidence against authenticity is inconclusive, but he nonetheless considers the *Idyll* spurious on subjective grounds. See also the evidence gathered by L. E. Rossi, "Mondo pastorale e poesia bucolica di maniera: l'idillio ottavo del *corpus* teocriteo," *SIFC* 43 (1971) 5–25, that the poet imitated, and sometimes misunderstood, the genuine *Idylls*. A notable exception to the general climate of opinion is Thomas Rosenmeyer, *The Green Cabinet* (Berkeley 1969) x.

[3] E. Fairon, "De l'authenticité de l'idylle VIII du recueil de Théocrite," *Revue de l'instruction publique en Belgique* (1900) 239; A. Rostagni, "L'idillio VIII di Teocrito e la sua autenticità," *Scritti minori* 2, pt. 1 (Turin 1956) 229–30; R. J. Cholmeley, ed., *The Idylls of Theocritus* (London 1919²) *ad* 43; G. Perrotta, "Teocrito e il poeta dell' idillio VIII," *A&R*, n.s. 6 (1925) 76–77; E. Bignone, "L'idillio VIII de Teocrito e la sua autenticità," *A&R*, 3d ser. 1 (1933) 231; Werner Arland, *Nachtheokritische Bukolik bis an die Schwelle der lateinische Bukolik* (Diss. Leipzig 1937) 12. H. White, "On the Structure of Theocritus' Idyll VIII," *MPhL* 4 (1981) 181–90, seems to take an inconsistent position. She claims that Daphnis and Menalcas are children who "when they sing love songs . . . imitate their elders" (189), but elsewhere she asserts that Daphnis is "the lover of Milon" and has both "heterosexual and homosexual affairs" (188–89).

devoid of characterization, a poem whose meaningfulness lies solely in the charm of its verse.[4] That seems all the more odd since the principal model was probably Theocritus' *Idyll* 5.[5] The singers there may exaggerate, but their songs do deal with their own lives—the previous love affair with each other, Comatas' current preference for girls and Lacon's for boys.

I propose that there is a kind of characterization in *Idyll* 8, not the vivid, realistic characterization that we often find in the genuine *Idylls*, but a stylized characterization based on legend and role. This results at least partly from the poet's choice of subject matter. The bucolic contest in the *Idyll* is a prototypic one, the one in which the mythical Daphnis defeated the mythical Menalcas and established his preeminence in bucolic song. The poet's mode of presenting this landmark performance is to exaggerate pastoral style in the direction of mannerism and total conventionality.[6] Correspondingly, his characterizations are artificial and allusive. Daphnis' youthfulness and sexual attitudes do not have the verisimilitude of a Lacon or a Comatas, but they are consistent, so I shall argue, with the role he plays in the traditional legend about him. For Menalcas legend is apparently of less importance. His personality and interests seem constructed primarily to complement or act as a foil for the Daphnis figure. That Daphnis should be the poet's focus is not surprising, since he is the pastoral hero par excellence and his story is the principal and formative legend of pastoral poetry.

First then, the myth about him.[7] It belongs to Sicilian tradition and may have appeared in literature as early as Stesichorus (Aelian, *Var. Hist.* 10.18 = *PMG* 279). In the fourth century the historian Timaeus summarized it, and from that source apparently derive the extant accounts found in Parthenius (29), Aelian (*Var. Hist.* 10.18), Diodorus Siculus (4.84), Servius auctus (*ad Ecl.* 5.20, 8.68), and Junius Philargyrius (*ad Ecl.* 5.20).[8] The basic story is the same in each. Daphnis the cowherd

[4] Cf., for example, Perrotta (above, note 3) 77: "La verità è che le varie battute del canto amebeo non hanno nessuna unità e nessuna continuità. . . . Le varie pennellate sono più o meno belle; alcune sono bellissime; ma il quadro non c'è. Dafni e Menalca sono nomi senza soggetto, lontani dalla realità e dalla vita."

[5] See Arland (above, note 3) 11; Rossi (above, note 2) 18.

[6] For the poem's importance in the development of the "bucolic manner," see Rossi (above, note 2) 10, 24–25 and J. Van Sickle, "Theocritus and the Development of the Conception of Bucolic Genre," *Ramus* 5 (1976) 25–26.

[7] In general, see the articles on Daphnis in *RE* 4 (1901) 2141–46 and Roscher's *Ausführliches Lexikon der griechischen und römischen Mythologie* 1 (1884–86) 955–61; U. von Wilamowitz-Moellendorff, "Daphnis," *Reden und Vorträge* 1 (Berlin 1925) 259–91.

[8] The *Sicelica* of Timaeus is named as a source only in the headnote to Parthenius' account. The scholia on Theocritus are practically worthless as a source of the Daphnis story, since they are based on a combination of the legend deriving from Timaeus and the scholiasts' own attempt to find the story behind the poetry they are interpreting. This is

was a son of Hermes[9] and skilled at playing the pipes. A nymph fell in love with him and elicited from him a promise not to sleep with any other woman. Some time later he was seduced by a princess and lost his sight as punishment.[10] There is nothing here which is inconsistent with *Idyll* 8, where Daphnis is a cowherd, a singer of pastoral songs, and destined while still quite young to marry a nymph.

Menalcas is more shadowy. Since he plays no part in the Sicilian legend about Daphnis, it seems that he was originally a separate pastoral character.[11] One tale about him, perhaps an important one, appeared in Clearchus (Athen. 14.619C–D). Menalcas rejected the love of Eriphanis, and she wandered through mountain thickets until even the beasts wept in sympathy with her. In her suffering she composed the *νόμιον*, containing the phrase *μακραὶ δρύες, ὦ Μέναλκα*, probably as a refrain. The *νόμιον* is a herdsman's song (Apoll. Rhod. 1.575–78; Longus 4.15) and thus parallels the cowherd's song, *βουκολικὸν μέλος*, of which Daphnis is said to be the originator (Diod. 4.84.3) or original topic (Aelian; cf. Philargyrius). This similarity of legend may explain how Daphnis and Menalcas came to be associated as rival singers. A contest between them appeared also in Sositheus' play *Daphnis or Lityerses*, where Pan acted as judge (schol. *ad Id.* 8 *arg.*; cf. Athen. 10.415B; Serv. auct. *ad* 8.68). Daphnis' victory there apparently preceded his marriage to a nymph, just as it does in *Idyll* 8.

The poem opens with the statement that Daphnis while herding his cattle was once met on the mountains by Menalcas tending his flocks:[12]

> *Δάφνιδι τῷ χαρίεντι συνάντετο βουκολέοντι*
> *μῆλα νέμων, ὡς φαντί, κατ' ὄρεα μακρὰ Μενάλκας.*
> *ἄμφω τώγ' ἤστην πυρροτρίχω, ἄμφω ἀνάβω,*
> *ἄμφω συρίσδεν δεδαημένω, ἄμφω ἀείδεν.* (1–4)

In 1–2 the chiastic arrangement of names and modifying participles introduces the mannered style which characterizes this poet's interpretation of

---

illustrated well by the scholium on *Id.* 8.93a, where the reader is given a choice of possible interpretations. I cite from Carl Wendel, ed., *Scholia in Theocritum vetera* (Leipzig 1914).

[9] According to Aelian, he was the son *or* beloved of Hermes.

[10] The blinding was apparently the ending in Timaeus and fits well a legend about a singer which perhaps goes back to the age of Stesichorus (*PMG* 192; cf. the Thamyris story, *Il.* 2.594–600). The alternative or additional suffering of death or metamorphosis is found in some of the poetry about him and the commentators thereon: *Id.* 1.66–141; 7.73–77; Verg. *Ecl.* 5; Serv. auct. *ad* 5.20, 8.68; Ov. *Met.* 4.276–78.

[11] On Menalcas and Daphnis, see I. Trencsényi-Waldapfel, "Werden und Wesen der bukolischen Poesie," *Acta Antiqua* 14 (1966) 20–21. Hermesianax (schol. *ad Id.* 8.53–56d) made Daphnis the lover of Menalcas, but that poet was notorious for outrageous invention. The story that Menalcas loved Euippe and, being rejected, threw himself down a precipice, may also be Hermesianax's own creation (schol. *ad Id.* 9 *arg.*).

[12] I cite from A. S. F. Gow, ed., *Bucolici Graeci* (Oxford 1952).

bucolic convention. The elaborate balancing continues in 3–4 with the duals and quadruple ἄμφω.[13] The effect is flatness: Daphnis and Menalcas mirror each other too perfectly. Both have red hair, youth, skill in piping and singing. The only points of differentiation lead back to the traditions about them. The juxtaposition βουκολέοντι/μῆλα νέμων (1–2) in conjunction with the phrase ὡς φαντί (2) suggests Daphnis' association with bucolic song and Menalcas' with the νόμιον. That Daphnis is given, prominently, the epithet τῷ χαρίεντι (1) also recalls the tradition.[14] While his beauty is mentioned in almost all the prose accounts, Aelian's is particularly revealing. He reports that the nymph fell in love with a Daphnis who was "handsome, young, first growing a beard, that time when the youth of handsome lads is at its most charming (χαριεστάτη)." The charming Daphnis of *Idyll* 8 is apparently younger than this, since ἀνάβω (3; cf. παῖδες, 28, 29; μικκός, 64; παιδί, 66) refers to early adolescence, probably before the appearance of a beard.[15] At the end of the poem he is said to marry the nymph ἄκραβος ἐὼν ἔτι, "while still at the beginning of ἥβη" (see schol. *ad* 93b), an age which would directly follow the one to which ἀνάβω, "yet to reach ἥβη," refers. The boyhood of the two characters seems conditioned then by the poet's need to fit their contest into the traditional chronology of Daphnis' youthful attachment to the nymph.

In setting up the contest (5–32) the poet again allows bucolic responsiveness to take the place of character drawing. Whole phrases and lines are repeated, tending rather to dullness than to an echoing effect (particularly 11 and 12, 13 and 17, 18–19 and 21–22). The matching appears even in the choice of stakes, syrinx against syrinx, so that the victor will have two pipes and the loser none. In character Menalcas does seem more aggressive than Daphnis, but there is no hint of a grudge that would account for his aggressiveness. In fact, we are never quite sure whether we should take the two as friends (cf. 33–40) or arch rivals (cf. their reaction to the judge's decision, 88–91). Menalcas' challenge seems designed primarily to make Daphnis' victory, when it occurs, more palatable and satisfying.

It is in the songs that the poet accomplishes a gradual differentiation of Daphnis and Menalcas. The elegiac portion of the contest consists of four sets of responding quatrains (one of which is lost); there follow two hexameter songs of eight lines each.[16] Throughout the match there is a pattern of

[13] The model for these opening lines was probably *Id.* 6.1–4, where there is a single ἄμφω.

[14] In Theocritus he is most often called ὁ βουκόλος (*Id.* 1.116, 6.1, *Ep.* 5.3), but in *Ep.* 2.1 he is ὁ λευκόχρως, an adjective which implies both youth and beauty.

[15] The scholiasts say younger than twelve or, with Wendel's deletion, younger than fifteen. That a boy who is ἄναβος may have a lover is clear from *Id.* 5.87.

[16] I follow the text printed by Gow, who assumes that four lines have dropped out after 52 and that 77 is an interpolation from *Id.* 9.7. The correctness of this assumption is strongly

lessening correspondence in both style and sentiment between challenging song and capping response. It seems that the purpose of this divergence is to distinguish in their emotional and psychological make-up the two boys who are on the surface so much alike. Menalcas we find a dreamy-eyed and not atypical shepherd boy, but in Daphnis we discover the conflicts of character that make possible the tragic outcome of the traditional legend.

In the first set of elegiac quatrains (33–40) each boy prays for abundance of pasture both for himself and his companion. Menalcas couches his request in the religious terms of *do ut des*: the bounty of nature in exchange for a pleasing gift of song. Daphnis, while repeating Menalcas' rhetorical structure, reformulates its religious character in more typically pastoral terms. While Menalcas' streams nurture through their divine power (*θεῖον γένος*, 33), Daphnis' pastures foster growth simply from the sweetness of their natural vitality (*γλυκερὸν φυτόν*, 37). The springs and pastures are to respond to his request, not so much as deity to devotee, but because of the sympathy or similarity between his own music and that of the nightingale, nature's most exquisite songstress. Thomas Rosenmeyer has argued that the gods, and religion, have no standing for Theocritus' herdsmen: "The beauty of the landscape which surrounds them does not derive from divine grace, but is part of the natural world which guarantees their freedom."[17] Daphnis avoids, in capping Menalcas' quatrain, any suggestion that song is a sacrifice, a necessary gift to obtain divine protection. By comparing himself to the nightingale he may hint that he is the better singer,[18] but he shows as well a more intimate bond with nature, an exclusively pastoral bond, based quite simply on the likeness of his song to the songs of nature.

In the second set of quatrains (41–48) there is again a matching of phrase to phrase, but now a distinction in personal qualities.[19] While both boys love, the object of Menalcas' affections is the male Milon and Daphnis sings of a female. Whether we take the manuscript reading *παῖς* in 43 or accept Meineke's emendation *Ναΐς*,[20] I think it is necessary

---

indicated by the neat regularity of the numerical patterns pointed out by K. Witte, "Das achte Gedicht der theokritischen Sammlung," *RhM* 73 (1920) 240–42, and by J. Van Sickle, "The Structure of [Theocr.] VIII," *MCr* 8–9 (1973–74) 200–201. The most obvious weakness of the argument against a lacuna in White (above, note 3) is that this gives Menalcas four quatrains to Daphnis' three. Such an imbalance in a contest predicated upon balance is scarcely defensible, certainly not by comparison with *Id.* 5 (White 189). There Comatas does sing one couplet more than Lacon, but Lacon is prevented from replying by the judge who declares Comatas the winner. Menalcas' extra quatrain would be sung in the middle of the contest by the eventual loser and for no apparent reason.

[17] Rosenmeyer (above, note 2) 190; see also 125–29.

[18] So White (above, note 3) 182–83.

[19] I accept the transpositions printed in Gow's text.

[20] Gow (*ad loc.*) points out that a proper name is needed to balance Milon in 47, and Wilamowitz, "Lesefrüchte," *Hermes* 58 (1923) 70, thought that the rhythm of the line is

to identify Daphnis' lover here with the nymph whom he is said to marry at the poem's close (93). The reader who knew the Daphnis myth would expect him to be attached to a nymph, and this identification allows us to see how Daphnis' quatrain differs from and caps Menalcas'.

Each singer claims a correspondence between his lover's presence or absence and nature's fullness or privation. The motif derives from the power that a god was thought to have over the landscape. A clear example comes from Callimachus' *Hymn to Apollo*:

> Φοῖβον καὶ Νόμιον κικλήσκομεν ἐξέτι κείνου,
> ἐξότ' ἐπ' Ἀμφρυσσῷ ζευγίτιδας ἔτρεφεν ἵππους
> ἠιθέου ὑπ' ἔρωτι κεκαυμένος Ἀδμήτοιο.
> ῥεῖά κε βουβόσιον τελέθοι πλέον, οὐδέ κεν αἶγες
> δεύοιντο βρεφέων ἐπιμηλάδες, ᾗσιν Ἀπόλλων
> βοσκομένῃσ' ὀφθαλμὸν ἐπήγαγεν· οὐδ' ἀγάλακτες
> οἶιες οὐδ' ἄκυθοι, πᾶσαι δέ κεν εἶεν ὕπαρνοι,
> ἥ δέ κε μουνοτόκος διδυμητόκος αἶψα γένοιτο. (47–54)

Menalcas sentimentalizes the motif by making it Milon, instead of a god, who causes growth or decay. In so doing he produces one of our earliest certain examples of the pathetic fallacy, the illusion that nature responds with sympathy to human emotion. Even his statement that the oaks are taller when Milon comes seems a trivialization of the concept, especially as the culminating item in his list. But Daphnis' very similar statement has a different coloring when we accept his lover as a nymph. For she must then, like Apollo, have a genuine ability to affect the waning or increase of life in nature (cf. some of the names given her elsewhere: Nomia, Pimplea, Thalia).[21] The dryness of the cows becomes not a sympathetic illusion, a reflection of Daphnis' romantic interest, but a true longing for the nurturing spirit of the land.[22] Daphnis' love of the nymph is thus directly tied to the needs of his herds. Significant in this regard is Diodorus' emphasis on the great care he gave his cattle and their consequent productivity; it was from this that he earned the title Βουκόλος (4.84.3). The relation between Daphnis' love of his animals and his love of the nymph is an essential point in understanding the myth about him and its formulation in this poem.

Since Daphnis' reply to Menalcas' third quatrain (49–52) is missing, we have no information about the closeness of correspondence here. But the

---

much improved by the lightening effect of the two syllable name. White (above, note 3) 183, however, insists that Ναΐδα in 93 is not a proper name, but a generic designation for a water-nymph (see also her "A Case of 'Arte allusiva' in Theocritus: Additional Note," *AC* 47 [1978] 166). Nais was current as a woman's name, though, by the fourth century B.C. (see Athen. 13.592c), and Parthenius (29) calls Daphnis' lover Echenais.

[21] Serv. auct. *ad* 8.68; cf. schol. *ad Id.* 8 *arg.*, 93a. She is also called Echenais by Parthenius and Lyca or Hedina by Philargyrius. It appears that in the tradition she was nameless and authors felt free to assign her any name deemed appropriate.

[22] In *Id.* 4.12–27, which may have influenced these two quatrains, it is the effect of Aegon's absence on the herd which is emphasized.

poet's fondness for bucolic *topoi* suggests what the response may have contained. It is a common wooing technique for a pastoral singer to exalt his profession by reminding his beloved of famous mythical herdsmen (cf. *Id.* 3.40–51, 20.34–41; Longus 3.34, 4.17). Proteus and his stinking seals are an appropriate, if humorous, parallel for Menalcas and his goats. Daphnis may have compared himself with any number of cowherds—Paris, Anchises, Adonis, Endymion, Attis, Ganymede (all listed in *Id.* 20.34–41). They are a more distinguished group, inclined to have deities as lovers. It is easy to see then how Daphnis may have capped Menalcas' quatrain.

In the last two elegiac quatrains (53–60) the opening priamels provide a clear structural similarity, while a balance in content is achieved by an antithesis in sentiment. Menalcas sings of the contentment he derives from song, the nearness of his flocks, and the embrace of his lover; Daphnis sings of the pain that comes to a man from "longing for a tender maiden." While Menalcas' addressee (*τν*, 55) is probably Milon,[23] Daphnis' "tender maiden" is not the nymph, or any specific person, but a generic type. The poet here foreshadows the many women who will later entice him (cf. Serv. auct. *ad Ecl.* 8.68, *Daphnin . . . ab omnibus amatum feminis*) and especially the one who will win his love (cf. Serv. *ad* 8.68, *hunc . . . nympha Nomia amaret et ille eam sperneret et Chimaeram potius sequeretur*). All of the prose accounts emphasize the nymph's love for Daphnis, but none mentions a passionate response on his part.[24] In this affair he was *ἐρώμενος*, not *ἐραστής*. But by nature he is a lover (*ἠράσθην*, 60), as in *Idyll* 7 (*Ξενέας ἠράσσατο*, 73) and *Idyll* 1 (*τίνος . . . τόσσον ἔρασαι*, 78; *Ἔρωτος ὑπ' ἀργαλέω ἐλυγίχθης*, 98). In both Theocritean poems his longing for a mortal girl is causing his death.[25] An epigram by Eratosthenes Scholasticus not only calls him

[23] Some have wished it to be Daphnis, but see Gow *ad loc.* R. Renehan, "Theocritus (?) VIII.53–56," *RhM* 108 (1965) 377, argues persuasively for keeping the manuscript reading in 56 and taking *σύννομα μῆλ'* as object of *ἄσομαι*. Menalcas' promise to sing of his flocks then looks forward to his next song (63–70), as Daphnis' reference to a "tender maiden" (59) prepares for the girl in his next song (72–80). This is quite likely to be right. It supports Gow's attribution of the quatrains 53–60 and my argument (see below) that the hexameter songs are thematically related to the earlier elegiac ones.

[24] Parth 29, *Ἐχεναΐδα νύμφην ἐρασθεῖσαν*; Diod. 4.84.4, *αὐτοῦ μίαν τῶν Νυμφῶν ἐρασθεῖσαν*; Ael. Var. Hist. 10.18, *ἠράσθη αὐτοῦ νύμφη μία*; Serv. auct. *ad Ecl.* 5.20, *adamatus a nympha est*; *ad* 8.68, *hunc . . . nympha Nomia amaret*; Philarg. *ad Ecl.* 5.20, *hic dilectus a Nympha Lyca vel Hedina.* The Theocritean scholiasts sometimes speak of Daphnis' love for a nymph, but this is based merely on their own (probably false) reading of *Id.* 1, not any traditional story. From the scholiasts' confused accounts may come Ovid *AA* 1.732 and Nonnus *Dion.* 15.308–10.

[25] The theory that Daphnis in *Id.* 1 is playing the part of a chaste Hippolytus (see Gow [above, note 2] II 2; Gilbert Lawall, *Theocritus' Coan Pastorals* [Washington 1967] 19–20) has clouded the point. While Hippolytus is indifferent to women, Theocritus' Daphnis is clearly in love. For his nature as a lover, see E. A. Schmidt, "Die Leiden des verliebten Daphnis," *Hermes* 96 (1968) 539–52. Scholars who have recently argued that Theocritus is

γυναικοφίλα, probably taken from *Idyll* 8.60, but also δύσερως, which presumably comes from Priapus' reproach in *Idyll* 1.85:

> τὼς τρητὼς δόνακας, τὸ νάκος τόδε, τάν τε κορύναν
> ἄνθεσο Πανὶ φίλῳ, Δάφνι, γυναικοφίλα.
> ὦ Πάν, δέχνυσο δῶρα τὰ Δάφνιδος· ἶσα γὰρ αὐτῷ
> καὶ μολπὰν φιλίεις καὶ δύσερως τελέθεις. (*A.P.* 6.78)

The model for this dedication was evidently *Epigram* 2 of the collection attributed to Theocritus:

> Δάφνις ὁ λευκόχρως, ὁ καλᾷ σύριγγι μελίσδων
> βουκολικοὺς ὕμνους, ἄνθετο Πανὶ τάδε,
> τοὺς τρητοὺς δόνακας, τὸ λαγωβόλον, ὀξὺν ἄκοντα,
> νεβρίδα, τὰν πήραν ᾗ ποκ' ἐμαλοφόρει. (*A.P.* 6.177)

Here the apple-pouch, the final, longest, and thus emphasized item, is not, I think, filled with "provision for the day," but with love tokens, which apples always are in Theocritus.[26] Daphnis' inclination to love women is invoked because it is an essential facet of his character, the one which leads to his sufferings (τὰ Δάφνιδος ἄλγεα, *Id.* 1.19, 5.20) and eventual loss. That the young Daphnis of *Idyll* 8 recognizes already the destructive potential of his desires is clear from his series of analogies—longing for a maiden is to a man as storm to trees, drought to waters, snares and nets to the birds and beasts of the wild (57–59).

The hexameter songs (63–70, 72–80, excluding 77), which are designated the conclusion of the contest (61–62), again display a correspondence of subject, though less similarity of phrasing. Both concern that which threatens the boy's role as herder; κἦμ' (72) as the first word of Daphnis' song points up the connection.[27] Menalcas sings of wolves and dearth of pasture, external threats, threats feared by real shepherds. For Daphnis, however, the threat is an internal one and thus more poetic in

---

following, at least in part, the Sicilian legend include: R. M. Ogilvie, "The Song of Thyrsis," *JHS* 82 (1962) 106–10; F. J. Williams, "Theocritus, *Idyll* i 81–91," *JHS* 89 (1969) 121–23; Ellen Lambert, *Placing Sorrow: A Study of the Pastoral Elegy Convention* (Chapel Hill 1976) 13–15; Anna Rist, trans., *The Poems of Theocritus* (Chapel Hill 1978) 23–27; Stephen Walker, *Theocritus* (Boston 1980) 39–43.

[26] The quoted words are from A. S. F. Gow and D. L. Page, *The Greek Anthology: Hellenistic Epigrams* 2 (Cambridge 1965) *ad loc.* References to apples occur at *Id.* 2.120, 3.10, 3.41, 5.88, 6.6–7, 10.34, 11.10. Cf. Günter Wojaczek, *Daphnis: Untersuchungen zur griechischen Bukolik*, Beiträge zur klassischen Philologie, Heft 34 (Meisenheim am Glan 1969) 18.

[27] This point of correspondence has generally eluded scholars. See, for instance, Cholmeley (above, note 3) *ad* 72; R. Merkelbach, "Βουκολιασταί (Der Wettgesang der Hirten)," *RhM* 99 (1956) 119–20; Rossi (above, note 2) 18. White (above, note 3) 188 takes Daphnis' last song as a reply to quatrain 57–60 (which she assigns to Menalcas), not to the other hexameter song. Both Merkelbach and Rossi explain this usage of καί as an inept imitation of Lacon's responses in *Id.* 5, e.g., 5.90. But cf. the κἠγώ of *Id.* 9.15, where καί seems to indicate that Menalcas' song about the pleasures of winter will answer Daphnis' song about the pleasures of summer.

scope. Yesterday, he says, a girl whose brows meet (a mark of beauty) called him καλὸν καλόν (73) as he drove his heifers past her cave. This κόρα (72) I take to be one of the mortal women who desired Daphnis because of his youth and beauty (cf. again Serv. auct. *ad* 8.68: *Daphnin pulcherrimum inter pastores et ephebum et ab omnibus amatum feminis*; *Id.* 1.82–85, ἁ δέ τυ κώρα . . . ζάτεισ᾽).

His reaction is the key. He makes no response, not even in refusal, and hurries past with eyes averted. We may compare Parthenius' statement (29) that after the nymph commanded his fidelity Daphnis "resisted strongly (καρτερῶς ἀντεῖχε) for some time, although not a few women were mad for him."[28] In *Idyll* 8 his behavior may seem simply the natural modesty of early adolescence, and psychologically this explanation surely has some validity.[29] But Daphnis offers his own explanation. In place of the charms of the girl and the secrecy of her cave, he chooses the mooing of calves and a nap by cool water on a summer's day (76, 78).[30] For the cows are a κόσμος for the cowherd, he says, like acorns to the oak, apples to apple-trees, and the calf to the cow (79–80). This series of analogies serves as a kind of bucolic creed, giving the cowherd's devotion to his cows a place within nature's order of nurturing and growth.[31] The implication is that sexual contact with a mortal would disturb the exclusivity of this devotion and thus foster the separation of Daphnis from nature. He may point here to an interpretation of the traditional legend, to the reason he vows fidelity to the nymph in the face of natural longings for other women. But dramatically more is suggested, that his attachment to his cows (and the nymph) is the result of a youthful naiveté which fails to recognize the potential strength of his mature sexuality.

[28] Parthenius also mentions his total isolation from human company since he remained on Etna both summer and winter—apparently in way of explanation of his affair with the nymph and the seduction by a more worldly princess.

[29] There is no inconsistency between Daphnis' modesty here and his erotic longings in the last quatrain if we do not demand too much verisimilitude. The seeming conflict arises from the poet's attempt to encapsulate in a scene of the cowherd's youth those personality traits essential to the legend about him. It is important to note that no desire for any specific maiden is mentioned in 57–60, but a general propensity to love. Daphnis' current behavior toward girls is shown in the hexameter song.

[30] Cf. Gow *ad* 76 ff.: "The meaning seems to be that Daphnis's pleasures are found elsewhere, and that a herdsman's business lies with his herd, not with young women in caves." The maiden's coy remark to Daphnis in *Id.* 27.7, καλόν σοι δαμάλας φιλέειν, οὐκ ἄζυγα κώραν, while undoubtedly comic, also evidences the traditional conflict between loyalty to his herding and erotic desires.

[31] In *Id.* 1.132–36, since Daphnis is dying, he asks that nature's processes alter, that flowers bloom on brambles and juniper, the pine bear pears, the stag chase the hound, and the untuneful owl rival the nightingales. While this series of *adynata* is the opposite in a sense of 8.76–80, in both passages Daphnis seems to feel that his life and interests stand in sympathetic association with nature's order.

At the conclusion of the songs the goatherd awards the two pipes to Daphnis and offers to pay him well for instruction in singing. From this time forth Daphnis was foremost among shepherds and while still in earliest youth married the nymph (92–93). Gow (*ad* 82) points out that the decision in his favor seems based on the superiority both of his voice (φωνά, 82) and of his verses (στόμα, 82). The poem gives us some justification then for saying that Daphnis' words convey better than Menalcas' what pastoral is all about. The imagery of the goatherd is suggestive in this regard. Daphnis' voice is sweet, like that of the calf, and hearing his song is better than licking honey. Underneath the rustic simplicity of expression is an indication that Daphnis' music shares in nature's reserve of sweetness and beauty. His marriage to the nymph is made to seem the expected consequence of his oneness with nature.

Idyll 8 is not just "a simple singing-match between Daphnis and Menalcas."[32] It is true that we do not find in it Theocritus' capacity to probe myth and make it timelessly meaningful. We miss especially that balance between artificiality and realism which is a mark of the genuine *Idylls*; the contest exists for the sake of its own convention and fails to arise out of the personalities of its participants. But this is not to say that the poem is totally without characterization or has no story to tell. Its primary goal, as it seems, is to present an early event in the life of Daphnis with an eye to suggesting how the seeds of the better-known tragedy are present in his youthful personality.

To concentrate on the childhood or youth of a mythical character was a common Hellenistic device for story-telling.[33] Theocritus' *Heracliscus* (*Idyll* 24) and Callimachus' *Hymn to Artemis* are outstanding examples. We may also think of Callimachus' *Hymn* 5, in which Teiresias is just an adolescent when he is blinded by Athena, and of *Hymn* 6, in which Erysichthon, an adult sinner in earlier myth, becomes merely a hot-headed youth.[34] *Idyll* 8 apparently postdates these poems and may have been written in the second half of the third century;[35] we find in it an element which becomes popular in later Hellenistic literature, the depiction of the awakening of sexual desire in an adolescent. Moschus'

[32] Cholmeley (above, note 3) 249.

[33] This is, in general, connected with the Hellenistic poet's taste for what is ordinary or realistic, as opposed to what is grand. See, among other literature, Ph.-E. Legrand, *La Poésie alexandrine* (Paris 1924) 99–102; Hans Herter, *Kallimachos und Homer* (Bonn 1929) 15–32; Alfred Körte, *Die hellenistische Dichtung*, rev. P. Händel (Stuttgart 1960) 236–39; D. O. Ross, Jr., "The *Culex* and *Moretum* as Post-Augustan Literary Parodies," *HSCP* 79 (1975) 260–63. On the related interest in large and small in Hellenistic art and literature, see John Onians, *Art and Thought in the Hellenistic Age* (London 1979) 121–33.

[34] See K. J. McKay, *Erysichthon: A Callimachean Comedy*, *Mnemosyne* Suppl. 7 (Leiden 1962) 72.

[35] Arland (above, note 3) 64; Rossi (above, note 2) 25.

Europa has this as a central, if covert, theme, and it is basic to the two *pastourelles*, *Idylls* 20 and 27, preserved in the Theocritean corpus. The hero of the *Iliad* himself can become the subject of a bucolic poem if he is young and in love. The surviving portion of the *Epithalamium of Achilles and Deidamia* describes Achilles' seduction of Deidamia while in feminine disguise on Scyros; the story is set in a conventional bucolic frame, reminiscent of the stylized frame of *Idyll* 8. Even the tendency to elaborate parallelism (cf. the tetracola in 15–17, 18–20, and 22–24, and the repetitions in 28 and 29) seems a legacy from the mannerism of that poem. *Idyll* 8 occupies then a central position in a line of Hellenistic poems depicting a youthful experience, sometimes erotic, of a mythical character.

Daphnis, unlike Heracles, Teiresias, Erysichthon, and Achilles, was a folktale figure who gained prominence in literature only in the Hellenistic period. He found a place in the poetry of Sositheus, Hermesianax, and others, but the most famous treatment of his legend must surely have been the first *Idyll*. It is hard to believe that the author of *Idyll* 8, who was so dependent on other Theocritean pastorals, was not influenced by that poem in his characterization of the bucolic hero.[36] Ettore Bignone observed, in fact, that the Daphnis of *Idyll* 1 "è preparato dal giovane pastore dell' *Idillio* VIII."[37] Although he believed that Theocritus had written both poems, there is no reason that a Theocritean imitator may not have sought to "prepare for" and perhaps elucidate his master's complex portrait of a dying cowherd. The Daphnis of *Idyll* 8 does seem a younger and simpler version of Theocritus' character: both have a special intimacy with nature and both are resisting the temptations of sexual desire. The younger Daphnis is able to resist because of his still immature sexuality, while the older one is wasting away under the full force of his mature longing. It has been suggested that in Theocritus' poem he is refusing further intercourse with his mortal lover and has resumed obedience to his vow.[38] It is perhaps easier to assume that this Daphnis is just a mature version of the one we meet in *Idyll* 8, always faithful to the nymph and the life in nature she represents but now dying from his passion for the "foreign one," Xenea, as she is called (*Id.* 7.73).

If *Idyll* 8 is not as poetically compelling as the pastorals which are certainly Theocritus', it is nevertheless a valuable exemplar of the genre. It

[36] Yet Gow (above, note 2) II 171 argues that "Daphnis's marriage with Nais (93) is inconsistent with the story of Daphnis in *Id.* 1." His statement arises from the belief that Theocritus' Daphnis is chaste like Hippolytus. If this theory is rejected, the inconsistency vanishes.

[37] *Teocrito: Studio critico* (Bari 1934) 373; cf. also Auguste Couat, *Alexandrian Poetry under the First Three Ptolemies*, trans. J. Loeb (London 1931) 452–56, who connects the two poems, but under the umbrella of the Hippolytus theory.

[38] Williams (above, note 25) 123; Rist (above, note 25) 25.

stands in a position of transition between the expansive meaningfulness of the genuine *Idylls* and the static conventionality of later Greek bucolics. From this vantage of closeness to and distance from the creation of the genre, the poem can give an explicit, if sentimentalized, version of what is only implicit in Theocritus. As a result it becomes our clearest statement of the relationship between herdsman, nature, and song which informs all of Greek pastoral, and not just as convention, but as primary theme.[39]

[39] I wish to thank Professor B. H. Fowler of the University of Wisconsin and two anonymous referees of this journal for helpful comments, and the Classics Fund of the University of Cincinnati established by Louise Taft Semple in memory of her father, Charles Phelps Taft, for a Summer Research Grant.